

Item No: D1
Subject: **PLANNING PROPOSAL - HERITAGE LISTING OF ROSE BAY SCOUT HALL, ROSE BAY**
Author: Shona Lindsay, Heritage Officer
Approvers: Chris Bluett, Manager - Strategic Planning
Allan Coker, Director - Planning & Development
File No: 20/37683
Reason for Report: To seek the advice of the Woollahra Local Planning Panel in relation to the preparation of a planning proposal to list the Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors) at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay as a local heritage item in Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014.

Recommendation:

THAT the Woollahra Local Planning Panel advises Council to:

- A. Proceed with the planning proposal to list *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay as a local heritage item in Schedule 5 of the *Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014*.
- B. Forward the planning proposal to the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment to list *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay as a local heritage item in Schedule 5 of the *Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014*, requesting a gateway determination to allow public exhibition.
- C. Request delegation from the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment in relation to the planning proposal, to carry out the plan-making functions of the Minister for Planning and Public Spaces under section 3.36 of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*.

1. Reason for report to the Woollahra Local Planning Panel (Woollahra LPP)

This report seeks the advice of the Woollahra LPP on the listing of the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay as a heritage item in the *Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014* (Woollahra LEP 2014).

On 27 September 2018, the Minister for Planning issued a Local Planning Panel Direction – Planning Proposals:

- A Council to whom this direction applies is required to refer all planning proposals to be prepared after 1 June 2018 to the local planning panel for advice, unless the council's general manager determines that the planning proposal relates to:
 - (a) the correction of an obvious error in a local environmental plan,
 - (b) matters that are of a consequential, transitional, machinery or other minor nature, or
 - (c) matters that council's general manager considers will not have any significant adverse impact on the environment or adjoining land.
- When a planning proposal is referred to the local planning panel, it must be accompanied by an assessment report prepared by council staff setting out recommendations, including whether or not the planning proposal should proceed.

- A proposal is to be referred to the local planning panel before it is forwarded to the Minister of the Greater Sydney Commission under section 3.34 of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979* (the Act).

In this case, the planning proposal is required to be referred to the local planning panel because the general manager has not made a determination in regard to items 1 (a), (b) or (c), above.

2. Background

On 18 June 2018 Woollahra Council resolved in part:

THAT Council:

- A. *Request staff to undertake an assessment of heritage significance for the Rose Bay Scout Hall (former RAAF Officers' Canteen) located in Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay, and report to the Environmental Planning Committee on whether the property has sufficient heritage significance to be listed as:*
 - i) *a local heritage item in the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014(WLEP), and*
 - ii) *an item on the State Heritage under the Heritage Act 1977.*

In response to Council's decision a heritage significance assessment of the *Rose Bay Scout Hall* was prepared by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning.

On 17 February 2020 a report on the Heritage Listing of the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay was presented to a meeting of the *Environmental Planning Committee (Annexure 3)* and on 24 February 2020 Council resolved in part:

- A. *THAT a planning proposal be prepared to list the Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors) as a heritage item in Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014.*
- B. *THAT the planning proposal be referred to the Woollahra Local Planning Panel for advice.*
- C. *THAT the advice of the Woollahra Local Planning Panel be reported to the Environmental Planning Committee.*

3. The site

The Rose Bay Scout Hall (Figure 1) is located at No. 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay (Figure 2 and 3). The site is identified as Lots 1536 and 1537 D.P. 40022 and Lot 1475 D.P. 752011.



Figure 1: Rose Bay Scout Hall, front (north-eastern) elevation (WP Heritage and Planning)



Figure 2: Site location. The arrow points to the site (Woollahra Council GIS)



Figure 3: Aerial photograph over the site with Scout Hall indicated by arrow (SIX Maps; annotation by WP Heritage and Planning)

4. Assessment of heritage significance

The assessment of heritage significance was undertaken in accordance with the document titled *Assessing heritage significance*, published by the NSW Heritage Office in 2001. The assessment used the process and criteria set out in that document. There are seven criteria used in the process of assessing heritage significance:

Criterion (a)

An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (b)

An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (c)

An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area).

Criterion (d)

An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.

Criterion (e)

An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW’s cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (f)

An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW’s cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (g)

An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW’s

- cultural or natural places, or
- cultural or natural environments,
(or a class of the local area’s
- cultural or natural places, or
- cultural or natural environments.)

Each criterion has inclusion and exclusion guidelines which are used to assist in the assessment process. If an item meets one of the seven heritage criteria at a local level, and retains the integrity of its key attributes, it can be considered to have local heritage significance. To be assessed for State significance an item will meet more than one of the seven heritage criteria at a State level, or if an item satisfies only one of the criteria, the item is of such particular significance to NSW that it should be listed.

The assessment prepared by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning, which includes the assessment against all criteria, is attached as *Annexure 2*.

Table 1 below provides a summary of the assessment of the heritage significance of the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* against the seven criteria, at the local and State levels.

Table 1: NSW Heritage assessment criteria summary – Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)

Criteria		Meets criteria for heritage listing and grading of significance	
		Local	State
(a)	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW’s cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✓	✗
(b)	An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW’s cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✓	✗
(c)	An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area)	✓	✗
(d)	An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons	✓	✗
(e)	An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW’s cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✗	✗

Criteria		Meets criteria for heritage listing and grading of significance	
		Local	State
(f)	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	✓	✗
(g)	An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cultural or natural places; or • cultural or natural environments. or a class of the local area's <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cultural or natural places; or • cultural or natural environments. 	✓	✗

The heritage significance assessment provides the following statement of significance for the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)*:

The Rose Bay Scout Hall, Rose Bay, has historic and aesthetic significance at a local level. The hall was designed by architect Charles Mack Walker and built in 1940 for the Rose Bay Scouts and Rose Bay Sea Scouts and, except for a brief period during World War II, it has been used by the Scouts (and other community groups) since this time. The hall is one of two known examples of buildings purpose-built for the Scouts in Woollahra during the Inter-War period. The building is a good example of a Scout hall that takes into consideration its setting, in this instance through the inclusion of porthole windows and a roof top deck from which to view Rose Bay. While the interior of the building has undergone some alteration, the exterior of the building is substantially 'as built.'

The Rose Bay Scout Hall has significance for its association, albeit brief, with the adjoining Rose Bay Flying Boat Base. Between October 1942 and the end of World War II, the building was used by the RAAF. The Rose Bay Flying Boat Base played an important service role during World War II and was the sight of huge receptions for returning Prisoners of War after World War II.

(October 2019: Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning: Heritage Assessment, Rose Bay Scout Hall p. 48)

The assessment recommends the listing of the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* as a local heritage item in Schedule 5 of Woollahra LEP 2014. The report concluded that the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* does not meet the threshold for State heritage listing.

5. Consultation with the land owner

All land owners and lease holders were consulted during the heritage assessment process.

All land owners and lease holders were provided a copy of the draft heritage significant assessment and draft heritage inventory sheet on 1 November 2019. The land owners and lease holders were given until the 2 December 2019 to make a submission. No comments were provided from the relevant land owners and lease holders.

Should a planning proposal proceed to public exhibition, consultation with land owners and lease holders will continue.

6. Planning proposal

A planning proposal has been prepared to list the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* as a heritage item in the Woollahra LEP 2014 (see *Annexure 1*).

6.1. Planning proposal structure

The planning proposal has been prepared in accordance with section 3.33 of the Act and the two documents prepared by the NSW Department of Planning and Environment titled *A Guide to Preparing Planning Proposals* (December 2018) and *A Guide to Preparing Local Environmental Plans* (December 2018).

6.2. Objective of amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014

The objective of the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014 is to recognise the heritage significance of *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay and provide it with a statutory heritage protection.

6.3. Explanation of provisions

The planning proposal outlines the following amendments to Woollahra LEP 2014:

- Insert a listing for the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* in Part 1 (Heritage Items) of Schedule 5 (Environmental Heritage). The exact wording of the amendment will be determined by the Parliamentary Counsel prior to the making of the LEP.
- Amend the Heritage Map (Sheet HER_005) to identify a heritage item on the site at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay.

6.4. Relationship to strategic planning framework

The planning proposal is consistent with the relevant objectives of *Greater Sydney Region Plan: A Metropolis of Three Cities* (2018) and the actions of the *Eastern City District Plan* (2018), (refer to section 6.2 of the planning proposal).

The planning proposal is consistent with the Council's Community Strategic Plan titled *Our Woollahra 2030: Our community, our place, our plan*. Notably, the planning proposal meets the following strategy within Goal 4 (Well planned neighbourhood) under the theme Quality places and spaces:

4.3 Protect local heritage and residential amenity, including significant architecture and the natural environment.

The planning proposal is also consistent with the *Woollahra Local Strategic Planning Statement* (approved by Council on 24 February 2020). In particular, the planning proposal is consistent with Planning Priority 5 under the theme of Liveability:

Planning Priority 5 Conserving our rich and diverse heritage

The planning proposal is consistent with the *Standard Instrument – Principal Local Environmental Plan* and all other applicable State environmental planning policies (refer to **Schedule 1** of the planning proposal).

The planning proposal is consistent with applicable section 9.1 directions (refer to **Schedule 2** of the planning proposal).

7. Conclusion

This report seeks the advice of the Woollahra LPP on a planning proposal to list the *Rose Bay Scout Hall (including interiors)* at 3 Vickery Avenue, Rose Bay as a heritage item in the Woollahra LEP 2014.

The planning proposal satisfies the requirements of section 3.33 of the Act as it includes:

- A statement of the objectives or intended outcome of the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014.
- An explanation of the provisions that are to be included in the amendment to Woollahra LEP 2014.
- The justification for the objectives, outcomes and provisions and the process for their implementation.
- Details of the community consultation that is to be undertaken.

Advice from the WLPP will be provided to Council.

Annexures

1. Planning Proposal - Rose Bay Scout Hall, 3 Vickery Avenue Rose Bay, March 2020 [↓](#) 
2. Heritage Significance Assessment for the Rose Bay Scout Hall [↓](#) 
3. Report to the EPC meeting of 17 February 2020 (annexures removed) [↓](#) 